



Jhanghiz Syahrivar <jhanghiz@president.ac.id>

Decision on your manuscript #JORH-D-19-00502R1

2 messages

Curtis Hart <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: Curtis Hart <cuh9001@med.cornell.edu>
To: Jhanghiz Syahrivar <jhanghiz@president.ac.id>

Thu, Jul 9, 2020 at 1:14 AM

Dear Mr. Syahrivar

We are pleased to inform you that your manuscript, "Hijab No More: A Phenomenological Study", has been accepted for publication in Journal of Religion and Health.

You will be receiving copyright and other transfer materials via email. Author proofs will then be sent to you for your attention.

If you have inquiries regarding your accepted paper being processed in the Production, please search for the 'Contacts' then select Production Editor.

A query form will then be provided for you to complete, afterwards click "Submit". Please remember to quote the manuscript number, JORH-D-19-00502R1, whenever inquiring about your manuscript.

Thank you.

Congratulations.
Yours sincerely,

Curtis Hart, MDiv
Editor-in-Chief
Journal of Religion and Health

As a result of the significant disruption that is being caused by the COVID-19 pandemic we are very aware that many researchers will have difficulty in meeting the timelines associated with our peer review process during normal times. Please do let us know if you need additional time. Our systems will continue to remind you of the original timelines but we intend to be highly flexible at this time.

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jorh/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the publication office if you have any questions.

Jhanghiz Syahrivar <jhanghiz@president.ac.id>
To: Curtis Hart <cuh9001@med.cornell.edu>

Thu, Jul 9, 2020 at 1:27 AM

Dear **Professor Curtis Hart, MDiv**

Thank you so much for the good news! I'm glad that my work can be a part of your reputable Journal.

I'll be waiting for the copyright and other transfer materials via email.

Sincerely Yours,

Jhanghiz

Jhanghiz Syahrivar

**Assistant Professor in Marketing and Management Studies
School of Business, President University, Indonesia**

PhD Hallgató in Business and Management

Department of Marketing, Corvinus University of Budapest, Hungary

email: jhanghiz@president.ac.id / jhanghiz@stud.uni-corvinus.hu

M: +62 813 1761 6239 / +36 706 050 066

"The best trait of character is endurance in matters of right."

[Quoted text hidden]



Jhanghiz Syahrivar <jhanghiz@president.ac.id>

Decision on your Manuscript #JORH-D-19-00502

2 messages

Curtis Hart <em@editorialmanager.com>
Reply-To: Curtis Hart <cuh9001@med.cornell.edu>
To: Jhanghiz Syahrivar <jhanghiz@president.ac.id>

Fri, May 1, 2020 at 12:04 AM

CC: cuh9001@med.cornell.edu, cwhart@stpierre.org

Dear Mr. Syahrivar,

In its present form we cannot accept your article for publication in the Journal of Religion and Health. If you are willing to make certain revisions, however, we would be happy to reconsider it. We have attached some comments by a reviewer that should direct you in this process.

Please make sure to submit your editable source files (i. e. Word, TeX).

In order to submit your revised manuscript electronically, please access the journal's Editorial Manager site.

Your username is: jhanghiz

If you forgot your password, you can click the 'Send Login Details' link on the EM Login page at <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jorh/>

Click "Author Login" to submit your revision.

Yours sincerely,

Curtis Hart, MDiv
Editor-in-Chief
Journal of Religion and Health

COMMENTS FOR THE AUTHOR:

Reviewer #1: General Comments

This is an interesting topic which explores the real issues happen in small community outside Muslim countries. The title "Hijab No More" is really attractive, so people could not wait to read. This study has the potential to theoretically and managerially contribute to compensatory consumption phenomenon in the context of religiosity.

Abstract

The abstract offers a complete picture in one paragraph. Please add the research approach adopted for this study to achieve this objective. If hijab is considered as the main focus in this research, then it is better "hijab" is added as one of the keywords.

Introduction

The introduction, essentially communicating the importance of the research, usually shows the research gap. This is nicely achieved.

Pg. 1, Lines 24-30: The Hijab- this paragraph is effectively presented.

Pg. 1, Lines 46-55: The phenomenon -this paragraph effectively introduces the "Hijab No More" phenomenon. To make it stronger, please add more examples related to the issue why many Muslim women against compulsory hijab.

Pg1, Lines 57: Dissociation, well introduced in this paragraph.

It is mentioned in abstract as follows: "Muslim women who were raised with conservative value at home countries" (Line 10), but then it is not discussed in the Introduction. It is important to explore what happened to these Muslim

women during their childhood and teenage years. What kind of conservative values they learn when they grow up. Why do these conservative values disappear easily?

Literature Review

The literature review outlines studies relevant to the research topic. Here are some comments to improve this section:

Pg 2, lines 10-60: This paragraph explores the compensatory consumption and is effectively presented. The disassociation phenomenon is inserted in Line 23-32. The concept of disassociation needs to be explored more deeply, especially its relation with compensatory consumption.

Methodology

There is a clear explanation on the step by step of the research undertaken. It is not difficult to understand the explanation in this section. However, some explanation should be added to improve this section. Here are specific comments on the section:

Pg. 3, Lines 7-14: Qualitative study - This paragraph is effectively presented

Pg. 3, Lines 16-24: Sampling - The criteria of participants. What is the rationale for this? Why criterion no 4 (she becomes an advocate who aims at discouraging other Muslim women from wearing hijab.), for example, is important?

Pg.3, Lines 31-41. There are 26 participants, what are these participants expected to do? (instruction to the participants). What was the demographic profile of these participants?

There is only one participant who satisfied all the criteria mentioned above and agreed for an in-depth interview. What is the justification that one account is sufficient to cover the phenomenon under investigation?

Findings

There is a long 8-page table, from page 5 to 12. Would it be more appropriate to put this table in the appendix section?

Pg. 14, Line 21-31. The result well supported the interview results.

Discussion

Pg.14, line 34-35: "Muslim women who live in the western countries have to constantly negotiate between secular values and religious values". It will need to be explained further, why?

What are the limitations of the research?

Are there recommendations related to religion and health aspects?

The managerial implications need also to be addressed in the closing section.

As a result of the significant disruption that is being caused by the COVID-19 pandemic we are very aware that many researchers will have difficulty in meeting the timelines associated with our peer review process during normal times. Please do let us know if you need additional time. Our systems will continue to remind you of the original timelines but we intend to be highly flexible at this time.

This letter contains confidential information, is for your own use, and should not be forwarded to third parties.

Recipients of this email are registered users within the Editorial Manager database for this journal. We will keep your information on file to use in the process of submitting, evaluating and publishing a manuscript. For more information on how we use your personal details please see our privacy policy at <https://www.springernature.com/production-privacy-policy>. If you no longer wish to receive messages from this journal or you have questions regarding database management, please contact the Publication Office at the link below.

In compliance with data protection regulations, you may request that we remove your personal registration details at any time. (Use the following URL: <https://www.editorialmanager.com/jorh/login.asp?a=r>). Please contact the

publication office if you have any questions.

Jhanghiz Syahrivar <jhanghiz@president.ac.id>
To: Curtis Hart <cu9001@med.cornell.edu>
Cc: cu9001@med.cornell.edu, cwhart@stpierregroup.org

Sun, May 3, 2020 at 7:33 PM

Dear Professor Curtis Hart, MDiv

Editor-in-Chief

I hope you receive this email well.

First of all, thank you for positive feedback and for taking your time in reconsidering my work for publication in the Journal of Religion and Health. For your information, I have recently submitted the revised version I would like to highlight some improvements that I have made in the revised version in order to meet the standard of your Esteemed journal and the demands from the reviewer:

1. The revised article has been proofread, improved and reformatted. Hopefully the article is now more readable.
2. The revised article now contains 68 publications in total. It has more words (more than 10,000 words) and more pages compared to the previous version. Out of 68 publications, 4 research articles are from the Journal of Religion and Health:
 - Fani, M., Mohtashami, J., Karamkhani, M., & Abdoljabbari, M. (2018). Confrontation Process of Students with Hijab. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 1-19.
 - Ren, Z., Hood, R. W., Su, Q., & Sa, A. (2019). Traditionality, Spirituality and Somatoform Dissociation Symptoms in Chinese Buddhists. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 1-13.
 - Stolovy, T., Lev-Wiesel, R., & Witztum, E. (2015). Dissociation: adjustment or distress? Dissociative phenomena, absorption and quality of life among Israeli women who practice channeling compared to women with similar traumatic history. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 54(3), 1040-1051.
 - Wilhelm, L., Hartmann, A. S., Becker, J. C., Kişi, M., Waldorf, M., & Vocks, S. (2018). Body covering and body image: a comparison of veiled and unveiled muslim women, christian women, and atheist women regarding body checking, body dissatisfaction, and eating disorder symptoms. *Journal of Religion and Health*, 57(5), 1808-1828.
3. This study also builds its arguments based on the work of 4 above mentioned articles hence hopefully, you will find some continuity through my work.

All in all, I hope that you can find some merit in my work and that it is worthy of publication in the Journal of Religion and Health.

Thank you for your attention and support. I'm looking forward to receiving good news from your Esteemed Journal.

Sincerely Yours,

Jhanghiz

Jhanghiz Syahrivar
Assistant Professor in Marketing and Management Studies
School of Business, President University, Indonesia
PhD Hallgató in Business and Management
Department of Marketing, Corvinus University of Budapest, Hungary
email: jhanghiz@president.ac.id / jhanghiz@stud.uni-corvinus.hu
M: +62 813 1761 6239 / +36 706 050 066

"The best trait of character is endurance in matters of right."

Response to Reviewer Comments

Reviewer #1: General Comments

This is an interesting topic which explores the real issues happen in small community outside Muslim countries. The title "Hijab No More" is really attractive, so people could not wait to read. This study has the potential to theoretically and managerially contribute to compensatory consumption phenomenon in the context of religiosity.

Comment: Thank you for your positive comment!

Abstract

The abstract offers a complete picture in one paragraph. Please add the research approach adopted for this study to achieve this objective. If hijab is considered as the main focus in this research, then it is better "hijab" is added as one of the keywords.

Comment: the methodology of this research which is “phenomenological research design” has been added in the paragraph. The word “hijab” has also been added in the paragraph.

Introduction

The introduction, essentially communicating the importance of the research, usually shows the research gap. This is nicely achieved.

Comment: Thank you for your positive comment!

Pg. 1, Lines 24-30: The Hijab- this paragraph is effectively presented.

Comment: Thank you for your positive comment!

Pg. 1, Lines 46-55: The phenomenon -this paragraph effectively introduces the "Hijab No More" phenomenon. To make it stronger, please add more examples related to the issue why many Muslim women against compulsory hijab.

Comment: An additional paragraph mentioning a previous study in this topic has been added. For instance, a study by Fani et al. (2018) in the context of Iranian women provides fresh evidence of hijab dissociation among Muslim women. Their study emphasizes on the role of beliefs in the adoption/rejection of hijab. More explanations and previous studies have been added in the findings section.

Pg1, Lines 57: Dissociation, well introduced in this paragraph.

Comment: Thank you for your positive comment!

It is mentioned in abstract as follows: "Muslim women who were raised with conservative value at home countries" (Line 10), but then it is not discussed in the Introduction. It is important to explore what happened to these Muslim women during their childhood and teenage years. What kind of conservative values they learn when they grow up. Why do these conservative values disappear easily?

Comment: this has been addressed extensively in the findings section of the revised article. The manifestation of Islamic conservative values, aside from compulsory hijab for Muslim women, is the encouragement or persuasion to fight in the name of God and die as a martyr.

Literature Review

The literature review outlines studies relevant to the research topic. Here are some comments to improve this section:

Pg 2, lines 10-60: This paragraph explores the compensatory consumption and is effectively presented. The disassociation phenomenon is inserted in Line 23-32. The concept of disassociation needs to be explored more deeply, especially its relation with compensatory consumption.

Comment: more literature has been added in this section to explore deeper about dissociation and compensatory consumption. The revised article has a total of 68 articles/references.

Methodology

There is a clear explanation on the step by step of the research undertaken. It is not difficult to understand the explanation in this section. However, some explanation should be added to improve this section.

Comment: Thank you for your positive comment!

Here are specific comments on the section:

Pg. 3, Lines 7-14: Qualitative study - This paragraph is effectively presented

Comment: Thank you for your positive comment!

Pg. 3, Lines 16-24: Sampling - The criteria of participants. What is the rationale for this? Why criterion no 4 (she becomes an advocate who aims at discouraging other Muslim women from wearing hijab.), for example, is important?

Comment: The consumption of Islamic products has been discussed quite extensively in many studies, yet the opposite case which is the dissociation from Islamic products is rarely discussed. This study investigates the hijab dissociation phenomenon and I think the best person (people) to represent this phenomenon is an activist of hijab dissociation. Previous studies, such as Fani et al. (2018), have discussed why Muslim women decided to take off their hijabs in public but this study takes further by examining deeper hijab dissociation phenomena through the lens of the promoter/activist of hijab dissociation which to my knowledge is the first attempt in this area. Further, this study expands the literature in compensatory consumption by linking it with the non-consumption of religious products (dissociation).

Pg.3, Lines 31-41. There are 26 participants, what are these participants expected to do? (instruction to the participants). What was the demographic profile of these participants?

Comment: 26 participants are connected to the phenomenon under investigation which is hijab dissociation. The detail about it has been elaborated in the methodology and the findings ("hijab and choice" section). However, in the end I thought there was only one informant who satisfied all the four criteria, captured the phenomenon under investigation elaborately and agreed for a series of in-depth interviews. The remaining 25 informants partially satisfied the criteria (e.g. remove their hijabs while living in the West but unwilling to be called advocates or activists of hijab dissociation) and their stand points on hijab would be used to improve the validity of this study. The main informant in this study is a Lebanese. Meanwhile, the remaining 25 participants are Muslim immigrants who came from Azerbaijan (4), Iran (3), Indonesia (7), Turkey (4), Egypt (2) and Pakistan (5). They were somewhere between 25 to 35 years old with education backgrounds from Masters (19) to PhDs (6).

There is only one participant who satisfied all the criteria mentioned above and agreed for an in-depth interview. What is the justification that one account is sufficient to cover the phenomenon under investigation?

Comment: only one informant who satisfied all the four criteria, captured the phenomenon under investigation elaborately and agreed for a series of in-depth interviews. The hijab dissociation phenomenon in this study was explored based on her unique point of view. I would like to highlight that although the insights provided in this study is mainly based on one account but I had engaged with the informant for half a year through a series of online interviews (e.g. video calls) and email exchanges, giving me the opportunities to dig deeper and judge the informant's

consistency and accuracy. According to Hycner (1985), phenomenological research focuses on qualitative issues instead of quantitative ones given the vast amount of data generated from one interview only. The research comes to an end when saturation level is achieved, meaning no new emerging themes can be generated from the interviews. A study by Weber (2016) on Muslim digital feminism is an example of a qualitative study revolves around one informant yet is deemed appropriate to unravel the phenomenon under investigation. To improve the validity, I also surveyed 25 Muslim women who live in Europe through personal network and snowball sampling. To be noted, these 25 Muslim women partially satisfied the criteria mentioned in Methodology section. The survey aimed to explore to what extent the adoption of hijab was a personal choice among Muslim participants in order to further strengthen the results of this study.

Findings

There is a long 8-page table, from page 5 to 12. Would it be more appropriate to put this table in the appendix section?

Comment: the article has been reformatted, including the long table. In the revised version of the article, every theme is thoroughly explored and every statement is compared against previous studies. Hopefully they are now more readable.

Pg. 14, Line 21-31. The result well supported the interview results.

Comment: Thank you for your positive comment!

Discussion

Pg.14, line 34-35: "Muslim women who live in the western countries have to constantly negotiate between secular values and religious values". It will need to be explained further, why?

Comment: It has been explained in the revised version. For instance, on one hand Muslim women must satisfy the expectations from their families to observe Islamic practices (e.g. wearing hijab) and on the other hand they must also follow the norms in the secular society, such as to refrain from ostentatious display of religiosity (Wayland, 1997; Gies, 2006). Hair covering in secular societies can be a polemic wherein Muslim women who adopt such practice are seen as backward and oppressed hence are in need of liberation.

What are the limitations of the research?

Comment: The present study has a limitation. This study is mainly based on the testimonies of one informant who labels herself as an ex-Muslim. As noted by Groenewald (2004), the typical issue with phenomenological study is that it is hard to generalize the results since the reality of a phenomenon is perceived as unique and true to the participant or the informant. Therefore, the focus is on how well the phenomenon can be qualitatively explored and explained irrelevant to the numbers of the participants. A study by Weber (2016) on Muslim digital feminism is an example of a qualitative study revolves around one informant yet is deemed appropriate to unravel the phenomenon under investigation. In this effort, I have incorporated various modes, such as video call, email exchange (essay), online posting, academic articles, and a survey involving 25 other participants to improve the validity.

Are there recommendations related to religion and health aspects?

Comment: This has been addressed in the revised version. For instance, in this study, it has been suggested that hijab can be an object that induces an unpleasant memory or a traumatic experience. Hijab as an object can be symbolic because it is linked to event specific memories, especially concerning one's interactions with significant others in the past (Zittoun, 2009). Since the informant exhibited concerns with her natural skin tone or color and her physical attractiveness in general, it merits an investigation in the future whether hijab colors can reduce the negative feelings. Previous studies indicate that color has the power to regulate and improve mood (Yildirim, Hidayetoglu, & Capanoglu, 2011; Sokolova et al., 2015). Therefore, future studies in religion and health should investigate not only the symbolic meanings of hijab but also

how colors can affect these meanings and by extension, the well-being of Muslim women.

The managerial implications need also to be addressed in the closing section.

Comment: This has been addressed in the revised version. I can offer several managerial implications of this study: first, marketing practitioners in the hijab industry should make explicit in their messages on the connection between hijab adoption and their socio-psychological benefits (e.g. improved parent-child relationship). Second, hijab in the western countries needs to be continually redesigned so that beauty and modesty goals can intersect. One objection to the adoption of hijab in the western countries is that it looks conspicuous. Muslim women who observe hijab can be easily spot on in an environment where most women do not wear hijab. Therefore, a form of hijab that is practical but less conspicuous could also be developed. Third, policy makers should develop health programs for Muslim women as they constantly face dilemmas: satisfying the expectations of their families on one hand and satisfying the expectations of the secular society on the other hand. Moreover, non-Muslim majority countries may develop self-development programs (e.g. culture and language programs) targeted at Muslim immigrants in order to help them integrate faster with the locals.

[Quoted text hidden]